

Minutes of Special Meeting of Lucknow Cantonment Board held on 26.06.2021 at 10:00 AM in the Office of the Cantonment Board.

Present:

- | | | |
|--------------------------|---|------------------------|
| 1. Maj Gen Rajeev Sharma | - | President |
| 2. Shri Vikash Kumar | - | CEO & Member Secretary |
-

1. CONFIRMATION OF THE MINUTES OF BOARD MEETING HELD ON 04.06.2021

To confirm the minutes of Board meeting held on 04.06.2021.

Relevant file along with copy of the minutes of the Board meeting dated 04.06.2021 is placed on the table.

1. RESOLUTION

Considered and confirmed.

2. SETTING UP OF PSA OXYGEN PLANT IN CANTONMENT GENERAL HOSPITAL, LUCKNOW CANTONMENT

Reference Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Govt. of India, New Delhi letter No. S-12035/16/2021-Procl/Addl.PSAPlants-Part (1) dated 18.06.2021 and MoD ID No.14(6)/2021-D (Q &C) dated 22.06.2021.

To note the matter regarding setting up of PSA Oxygen Plant in Cantonment General Hospital, Lucknow Cantt.

Office Note:

Ministry of Health & Family Welfare, Govt. of India, New Delhi vide their letter referred above sanctioned setting up of 250 LPM capacity PSA Oxygen Plant for 60 beds in Cantonment General Hospital, Lucknow Cantt under PM CARES Fund. For site preparation and installation, the Executing Agencies are National Highway Authority of India and DRDO, respectively. Accordingly, a Rep. of NHAI has inspected the site at Cantt General Hospital on 23.06.2021 and the work of site preparation will be started during the first week of July, 2021.

Board may note the matter.

Relevant file is placed on the table.

2. RESOLUTION

Noted.

3. ENGAGEMENT OF PLACEMENT AGENCY

To consider for finalization of e tender bids received in respect of **Engagement of Placement agency 2021-22**. Tender notice was published on 28/03/2021 in daily newspaper Amar Ujala (**Hindi**) & The Indian Express (**English**) and through Govt. portal tender bearing ID 2021_DGDE_610045_1 & in response to the notices Five (05) firms participated in tender process & on technical evaluation, of the tenders only 03 firms qualified for financial Bids. After opening of financial bid, it has been noticed that all three firms have quoted 1% service charges. The Comparative statement is as under:-

S.No.		Rate Quoted		
		M/s Agarwal and Co. 24 - A MIG Friends Colony Shahgang Agra	M/s Mohd Khanna Enterprises 29, sindhu Nagar Krishna Nagar Alambagh Lucknow	M/s Lion Security Guards Services B 2/6 Vineet Khand Gomti Nagar Lucknow
	TENDER FOR ENGAGEMENT OF PLACEMENT AGENCY	1% Service Charges	1% Service Charges	1% Service Charges

Office Note

On opening of the financial bid it has been noticed that all three firms have quoted the service charges of **1% (one percent)** as profit. Therefore in the situation of tie the criteria have been adopted as per tender condition, for selection of the meritorious firm on the basis of highest points obtained by the firm, the detail of the merit points of all three firms are as under & according to the merit points M/s Mohd Khanna Enterprises had obtained 70 points which is highest.

Comparative Statement on tie on submission of percentage on service charges valid rates between among the participating firms

Sr. No	Details	Marks	M/s Agarwal & Co	M/s Mod Khanna Enterprises	M/s Lion Security & services
1.	Years of Experience in similar nature of work i.e. in providing Manpower (have to provide clients name and contact address) a) More than 10 years b) 5 to 10 years c) Less than 5 years	20 Points 10 Points 05 Points	20	20	20
2.	ISO Certification of the Company/ Firm (ISO 9001 – 2015) a) More than 01 b) Any 01	10 Points 05 Points	10	05	10

3.	Establishment/ Formation of company a) More than 10 years b) 5 to 10 years c) Less than 5 years	20 Points 10 Points 05 Points	20	20	20
4.	Single workorder of similar work in last 2 years a) Rs. 8 Crore or more b) Rs. 5 Crore to Rs. 8 Crore	10 Points 05 Points	05	05	05
5.	Head office of the Firm/ Company i.e. Physical location of the Contractor a) Within 50 Km from Lucknow Cantt b) More than 50 Km from Lucknow Cantt	10 Points 05 Points	0	10	10
6.	Past performance experience of the Contractor with Cantonment Board Lucknow	10 Points	10	10	0
			65	70	65

Relevant file is placed on the table.

Board may consider the matter.

3. **RESOLUTION**

Board considered the agenda side comparative statement prepared by Sanitation Section and approved the lowest bid of 1% Service Charges quoted by M/s Mohd Khanna Enterprises being achieved highest merit points. Necessary agreement be executed with the firm.

4. **ENGAGEMENT OF OUTSOURCE AGENCY FOR SUPPLY OF SAFAI KARAMCHARI UNDER (F-9 HEAD) MILITARY CONSERVANCY AGREEMENT 2021-22**

To consider for finalization of e tender bids received in respect of **Engagement of Outsourced agency for supply of Safaikaramchari under F-9 head in Military conservancy Agreement 2021-22**. Tender notice was published on 28/03/2021 in daily newspaper Amar Ujala (**Hindi**) & The Indian Express (**English**) and through Govt. portal tender bearing ID 2021_DGDE_624559_1 & in response to the notices Eight(08) firms participated in tender process & on the technical evaluation, of the tenders only 03 firms qualified for financial Bids. After opening of financial bid, it has been noticed that all three firms have quoted 1% service charges. The Comparative statement is as under:-

S.No.		Rate Quoted		
		M/s Agarwal and Co. 24 - A MIG Friends Colony Shahgang Agra	M/s Lion Security guards Services B 2/6 Vineet Khand Gomti Nagar Lucknow	M/s Mohd Khanna Enterprises 29, sindhu Nagar Krishna Nagar Alambagh Lucknow
	TENDER FOR COMPREHENSIVE CONSERVANCY WORKS IN MILITARY AREA	1% Service Charges	1% Service Charges	1% Service Charges

Office Note

On opening of the financial bid it has been noticed that all three firms have quoted the service charges of **1% (one percent)** as profit. Therefore in the situation of tie the criteria adopted as per tender condition, for selection of the meritorious firm on the basis of highest points obtained by the firm, the detail of the merit points of all three firms are as under & according to the merit points **M/s Agarwal & Co.** had obtained **100** points which is highest.

Comparative Statement on tie on submission of percentage on service charges valid rates between among the participating firms

Sl.No	Description	Max Score	Details	Break up of marks	M/s Agarwal & Co	M/s Mohd Khanna Enterprises	M/s Lion Security & services
1.	Organization Capacity	40	The bidder shall have executed "Similar Nature" of order of an amount not less than Rs. 2.5 Crore in last three financial years in Government Department/PSU/Autonomous body/ any other Govt. organization. Copy of Work order/Purchase order along with proof of completion certificate for the work to be uploaded online with technical bid.	15	40	35	15
			Further maximum five (5) "Similar Nature" work orders amounting to minimum of Rs. 1.5 Crore in Last 4 financial years in Government Department/PSU/Autonomous body/any other Govt. organization. Copies of Work Order/Purchase order along with proof of completion certificate for the work to be uploaded online with technical bid. For each order, bidder will get five (5) marks.	25			

2.	Financial Profile Total annual turnover in the last three years(2017-18, 2018-19,2019-20)(attach Annexure-I)	Asst 40	1 Crore upto 2.0 Crores	8	40	40	40
			Above 2.01 Crores upto 3.00 Crores	20			
			Above 3.01 Crores upto 4.00 Crores	30			
			Above 4.00 Crores	40			
3.	Number of Years in operations in providing Manpower, (Please provide client's name and contact address in Annexure)	20	01-years upto 03 years	03	20	20	20
			Above 03 years upto 05 years	05			
			Above 05 years upto 10 years	10			
			Above 10 years	20			
					100	95	75

Relevant file is placed on the table.

Board may consider the matter.

4. **RESOLUTION**

Board considered the agenda side comparative statement prepared by Sanitation Section and approved the lowest bid of 1% Service Charges quoted by M/s Agarwal & Co. being achieved highest merit points. Necessary agreement be executed with the firm.

Further, the PCB directed that basic conditions for calculating merit points of all tenders should be same in future like physical location of the Contractor.

5. **COMPREHENSIVE CONSERVANCY WORK OF RA BAZAR / RA LINE**

To consider for finalization of e-tender bids received for Comprehensive Conservancy work of RA Bazar/RA Line, the e- tender noticed was published on 28/03/2021 in daily newspaper Amar Ujala (Hindi) & The Indian Express (English) and also invited through portal tender bearing ID 2021_DGDE_624556_1 & in response to the notice Ten (10) firms participated in tender process & on technical evaluation, only 04(four) firms qualified for financial Bids. The Comparative statement of rates of the technically qualified firms are as under:-

S.No.	Rate Quoted			
	M/s AP Electric Works G-58 Sanjay Gandhi Puram Faizabad Road Lucknow	M/s Agarwal and Co. 24 - A MIG Friends Colony Shahgang Agra	M/s Lion Security guards Services B 2/6 Vineet Khand Gomti Nagar Lucknow	M/s Aryan Group of Guard Services 3/437 Sector J Aliganj Lucknow

TENDER FOR COMPREHENSIVE SANITATION MAINTENANCE WORK OF RA BAZAR & RA LINE LUCKNOW CANTT	Rs. 3,24,000/-	Rs. 4,24,200/-	Rs. 3,40,585.83/-	Rs. 22,565.21/-
---	----------------	----------------	-------------------	-----------------

Office Note

Doubt was accrued during the evaluation of financial bids, When observed that M/s Aryan Security services had quoted Rs.22565/-pm (Twenty Two Thousand Five Hundred Sixty Five only) per month for Comprehensive Conservancy works of RA Bazar/ RA Line, since the rates submitted by M/s Aryan Security Services, Bhopal appeared unreasonable, therefore this Office vide its letter no. LCB/06/MCA/2021-22 dated 04th June 2021 asked the firm to give reasonability/clarification on quoted rates and in response to this Office letter the firm vide their letter no. As/2021/0706/02 dt 07/06/2021 mentioned that the firm had quoted the labour rates (For one manpower) only, whereas as per the tender condition the firms has to quote rates for the quantum of work, as per Annexure B Page 11 & 12 (scope of work) of the tender document. ***'It shall be presumed that the bidder has fully inspected all the site and to make an assessment on the quantum of work before submitting the Financial bid'*** Since, the rate quoted by M/s Aryan Security services are **unreasonable** because as per the Official assessment of the minimum required man power is 20-25 persons to cater the quantum of work, according to the given scope of work. And according to the rates of Rs. 22,565/- per labour each month submitted by M/s Aryan Security Services, Bhopal shall be @ **Rs.4,51,300/-pm**.for 20 labours only will be much higher. Therefore, the second L2 Firm M/s AP Electric Works who quoted **Rs.3,24,000/-pm** could be considered for the works.

Relevant file is placed on the table.

Board may consider the matter.

5. RESOLUTION

Considered the matter in detail. Since the bid quoted by M/s Aryan Security Services are unreasonable (i.e. far below the reasonability), as such the same was rejected by the Board. Therefore, Board approved the bid of Rs. 3,24,000/- per month of second L-2 Firm M/s AP Electric Works. Necessary agreement be executed with the firm.

6. RENEWAL OF LICENSE TERM FOR PLACING OF CELL TOWER ON WHEELS ON CLASS 'C' DEFENCE LAND VESTED WITH LUCKNOW CANTONMENT BOARD.

Reference CBR No. 04 dated 30.7.2019.

To consider letter No. nil dated 11.6.2021 received from M/s Indus Towers Limited regarding renewal of term of license for one year w.e.f. 29.9.2021 for placing of cell tower and associate equipments on wheels at 07 sites/class 'C' Defence land vested with Cantonment Board Lucknow in terms of clause 03 of MoU dated 28.9.2019 and para 8 (b) (ii) & (vii) of Govt. of India Ministry of Defence letter No. F-11026/A/2005/D(Lands) dated 26.02.2018.

OFFICE NOTE:

The Competent Authority i.e. Principal Director, Defence Estates Central Command vide their letter No. 53905/Policy/Land/Vol-III/LC-3 dated 14.8.2019 had accorded the sanction for highest bid offered by M/s Indus Towers Limited for setting up cell tower on wheels on following 07 different sites classified as Class 'C' Defence land for two years only in terms of Policy issued by Govt. of India, Ministry of Defence vide letter No. F-11026/A/2005/D(Lands) dated 26.02.2018.

Sl. No.	Location of site for setting up Cell Tower on Wheels (CoW)	Classification of Land	Area in Sqm.	Highest bid offered/quoted by M/s Indus Towers Ltd.	
				Rate	Amount
1.	Vacant land behind B. No. 01 Atal Road on Sy. No. 122	'C'	200	10,997.40	21,99,480.00
2.	Vacant land behind RBI Bazar School MangalPandey Road on Sy. No. 17/2.	'C'	200	16,995.00	33,99,000.00
3.	ROB Sultanpur Road on Sy. No. 270/2	'C'	200	19,320.00	38,64,000.00
4.	Pipraghat on Sy. No. 257/3	'C'	200	10,997.40	21,99,480.00
5.	Near Dilkusha Lawn on Sultanpur Road on Sy. No. 244	'C'	200	10,997.40	21,99,480.00
6.	Behind B. No. 15, Thimaya road on Sy. No. 206/1	'C'	200	16,995.00	33,99,000.00
7.	Sardar Patel Road, KhatiyaGodown on Sy. No. 441/1	'C'	200	16,995.00	33,99,000.00

Accordingly, MoU between Lucknow Cantonment Board and M/s Indus Towers Limited was executed on 28.9.2019, an amount of Rs. 2,06,59,440.00 annual license fee was also deposited in advance and license was granted by this office vide letter No. LCB/4/1/11/1/Misc/CoW/2019 dated 28.9.2019 in favour of M/s Indus Towers Limited for a period of 02 years. Second instalment of annual license fee was also deposited by the licensee with Cantonment Board Lucknow.

In terms of clause 02 of the MoU dated 28.9.2019 license was granted initially for a period of 02 years only, However, as per the license condition, it can be renewed at the end of license period by 01 year at a time at the discretion of the licensor i.e. Cantonment Board on fulfillment of terms and conditions. The total license term shall, however, not exceed 05 years.

Further, in terms of Para 08 (b) (vii) of MoD letter dated 26.02.2018 license fee will be revised by 10% on renewal of license. After expiry of maximum 05 years license period, fresh bids will be invited, if so required. As such the license period may be

renewed / extended for a period of 01 year w. e. f. 29.09.2021 to 28.09.2022 with a revision of license fee by 10%.

Board may consider the matter.

Relevant file along with letter dated 11.6.2021 of M/s Indus Towers Limited is placed on the table.

6. **RESOLUTION**

The Board considered the matter in detail and resolved that necessary proposal be forwarded to the Competent Authority i.e. PDDE, CC for obtaining necessary approval. After approval, further necessary action be taken accordingly.

With the permission of the Chair, the following agenda point has also been considered:

7. **E-TENDER FOR REPLACEMENT OF MAIN DISTRIBUTION WATER SUPPLY PIPELINE BY 4" DIA SIZE DUCTILE IRON PIPELINE IN MAKHANIYA MOHAL, LUCKNOW CANTT.UNDER ALLOTMENT OF SHARE OF REVENUE FOR THE YEAR 2021-21 (15TH FINANCE COMMISSION RECOMMENDATION).**

Reference CBR No. 04 dated 04.06.2021.

To consider the lowest tender rates for "Replacement of main distribution water supply pipeline by 4" dia size ductile iron pipeline in Makhaniya Mohal, Lucknow Cantt."

The Board vide its above referred resolution has approved for the work of "Replacement of main distribution water supply pipeline in Makhaniya Mohal, Lucknow Cantt." under the allotment of II Instalment of Tied Grant of Share of Revenue derived by State Govt. for the financial year 2020-21 to Lucknow Cantonment Board (15th Finance Commission Recommendation).

Accordingly, the tenders were invited for the first time through Government e-procurement Portal bearing Tender Ref No. LCB5/E/M/Makhaniya Mohal/WS/2021 published in daily newspapers namely Amar Ujala (Hindi) and The Indian Express (English) on 08.06.2021. In response to the tender notice, three technical bids were received on 21.06.2021 and after evaluation of the technical bids; all were found valid and their financial bids were opened on 25.06.2021. The details of the same are as under:

Sr No.	Name of Firm and Address	Rate quoted
1.	M/s S.B. Singh and Sons 274/A, 5 th Lane, Nishatganj, Lucknow	Rs 13,92,210.00
2.	M/s Vatsh Raj & Co. 307 Sadar Bazar, Cantt Lucknow	Rs 13,95,150.00
3.	M/s Omega Enterprises 695, Azad Mohal, Sadar Bazar, Cantt Lucknow	Rs 14,75,200.00

Office Note:

The lowest tender rates of Rs 13,92,210/- for the work of “Replacement of main distribution water supply pipeline by 4” dia size ductile iron pipeline in Makhaniya Mohal, Lucknow Cantt.” are quoted by M/s S.B. Singh & Sons. The rates quoted by M/s S.B. Singh & Sons for the subject work are reasonable since the lowest rates quoted are within the estimates prepared for the work and are only 0.93 % higher than the lowest rates approved by the Board for the same nature of work (calculated to equal quantity for comparison) vide its CBR No. 17 dated 30.07.2019. The contract value of the work is Rs 13,92,210/- only.

The tenders, comparative statement and all relevant documents are placed on the table.

7. RESOLUTION

Considered and approved the lowest rates of Rs. 13,92,210/- quoted by M/s SB Singh & Sons. Necessary agreement be executed with the firm.

Sd/-
(Vikash Kumar)
CEO & Member Secretary
Lucknow Cantt Board

Sd/-
(Maj Gen Rajeev Sharma)
President
Lucknow Cantt Board